Palatine Perspectives

Andrew Feldherr, Princeton University Münster, July 4 & 6, 2011

PART I—Ghosts in the Light: Poetry and Religion in Aeneid 8

1. Arma uirumque cano, Troiae qui primus ab oris Italiam fato profugus Lauiniaque uenit litora, multum ille et terris iactatus et alto ui superum, saeuae memorem Iunonis ob iram, multa quoque et bello passus, dum conderet urbem inferretque deos Latio; genus unde Latinum Albanique patres atque altae moenia Romae. Musa, mihi causas memora, quo numine laeso quidue dolens regina deum tot uoluere casus insignem pietate uirum, tot adire labores impulerit. tantaene animis caelestibus irae? (Aen.

(Aen. 1.1-11)

I sing of arms and the man, who first from the shores of Troy, an exile by fate, came to the Lavinian coasts. He was much cast about on land and sea by the power of the gods above, on account of the remembering anger of savage Juno, and endured many things in war as well in order to found his city and bring his gods to Latium. From there comes the Latin race, and the Alban fathers and the walls of lofty Rome. Muse, recall for me the reasons, with what harm to her divinity, or grieving at what did the queen of the gods compel a man marked for his piety to go through so many misfortunes, to approach so many labors? Do the souls of the heavenly gods have such great angers?

2. Mythicon appellant, quo maxime utuntur poetae; physicon, quo philosophi; civile, quo populi. Primum . . . quod dixi, in eo sunt multa contra dignitatem et naturam inmortalium ficta. In hoc enim est, ut deus alius ex capite, alius ex femore sit, alius ex guttis sanguinis natus; in hoc, ut dii furati sint, ut adulterarint, ut servierint homini; denique in hoc omnia diis attribuuntur, quae non modo in hominem, sed etiam quae in contemptissimum hominem cadere possunt.

(Varro, Ant. Div., fr. 7 Cardauns)

They call that which poets mostly use "mythical", that which philosophers use, "physical", and that which nations/peoples use, "civil" ... This first kind of theology contains many untruths which are made up against the dignity and nature of the immortals. For it tells how one god is born from a head, another from a thigh, another from drops of blood. Here we find stories of how gods stole, how they committed adultery, and how they were slaves to human beings. In sum, here everything which could happen not just to a human being, but to the most contemptible human being is attributed to the gods.

3. aude, hospes, contemnere opes et te quoque dignum finge deo, rebusque ueni non asper egenis.' (*Aen.* 8.363-5)

Dare, guest, to look down on riches and mold yourself too as worthy of a god; do not come reproachful of slight wealth.

4. Deuexo interea propior fit Vesper Olympo. iamque sacerdotes primusque Potitius ibant pellibus in morem cincti, flammasque ferebant. instaurant epulas et mensae grata secundae dona ferunt cumulantque oneratis lancibus aras. tum Salii ad cantus incensa altaria circum populeis adsunt euincti tempora ramis. hic iuuenum chorus, ille senum, qui carmine laudes Herculeas et facta ferunt: ut prima nouercae monstra manu geminosque premens eliserit anguis, ut bello egregias idem disiecerit urbes, Troiamque Oechaliamque, ut duros mille labores rege sub Eurystheo fatis Iunonis iniquae pertulerit. 'tu nubigenas, inuicte, bimembris Hylaeumque Pholumque manu, **tu** Cresia mactas prodigia et uastum Nemeae sub rupe leonem. te Stygii tremuere lacus, te ianitor Orci ossa super recubans antro semesa cruento; nec te ullae facies, non **te**rruit ipse **Ty**phoeus arduus arma tenens; non te rationis egentem Lernaeus turba capitum circumstetit anguis. salue, uera Iouis proles, decus addite diuis, et nos et tua dexter adi pede sacra secundo.' talia carminibus celebrant; super omnia Caci speluncam adiciunt spirantemque ignibus ipsum. consonat omne nemus strepitu collesque resultant. (Aen. 8.280-305)

Meanwhile the evening star approached, as the day declined. And now the priests, Potitius in the lead, were processing, clothed in pelts according to custom, and were bearing torches. They renew the banquets and bear the pleasant gifts of the "second table" and heap the altars from full platters. Then the Salii are present to sing around the kindled altars, their temples bound with poplar branches. This a chorus of youths, that of old men, who relate in song the praises of Hercules and his deeds, how he crushed the twin serpents, the first monsters of his stepmother, how he tore apart cities renown in war, Troy and Oechalia, how he endured a thousand hard labors under king Eurystheus by the dictates of unjust Juno. unconquered, slaughtered the cloud-born, double-limbed Hylaeus and Pholus with your own hand, and the Cretan monstrosities and the mighty lion under the cliff of Nemea. The Stygian marshes tremble at you, and the doorman of hell reclining over half-eaten bones in his bloody cave. But no apparitions terrify you, not Typhoeus himself holding his arms aloft, and you did not lack reason when the Lernaean serpent surrounded you with a mob of heads. Hail, true child of Jupiter, glory added to the gods, and come to us, and your rites, with favorable step." Such honors they proclaim in song, and in addition to all they throw in Cacus' cave, and Cacus himself breathing fire. The whole grove resounds together at the noise, and the hills echo it back.

4. Similes

a. Inde ubi prima quies medio iam noctis abactae curriculo expulerat somnum, cum femina primum, cui tolerare colo uitam tenuique Minerua impositum, cinerem et sopitos suscitat ignis noctem addens operi, famulasque ad lumina longo exercet penso, castum ut seruare cubile coniugis et possit paruos educere natos: haud secus ignipotens nec tempore segnior illo mollibus e stratis opera ad fabrilia surgit. (Aen. 8.407-15)

Then when the first repose had driven out sleep, when the middle of night's course was past, when first a woman who bears the burden of supporting her life with the distaff and her fine weaving has stirred the ash and awoken the sleeping fires, adding the night to her effort, and works her maidservants by lamp light with their long tasks, to keep her husband's house clean, and be able to raise her small children: not otherwise and no more sluggish at that time does the fire-ruling god rise from his soft bed to the works of the forge.

b. at specus et Caci detecta apparuit ingens regia, et umbrosae penitus patuere cauernae, non secus ac si qua penitus ui terra dehiscens infernas reseret sedes et regna recludat pallida, dis inuisa, superque immane barathrum cernatur, trepident immisso lumine Manes. (Aen. 8.241-46)

Then the cave and the huge palace of Cacus appeared, having been laid open, and the shadowy caverns were visible to their depths, not otherwise than if the earth gaping deeply from some force should expose the places of the dead and reveal the pale kingdoms, hateful to the gods, and the mighty pit should be viewed from above and the ghosts tremble at the light let in upon them.

c. dixerat et niueis hinc atque hinc diua lacertis cunctantem amplexu molli fouet. ille repente accepit solitam flammam, notusque medullas intrauit calor et labefacta per ossa cucurrit, non secus atque olim tonitru cum rupta corusco ignea rima micans percurrit lumine nimbos; (Aen. 8.387-92)

The goddess finished her speech and, as her husband lingered held in her arms, caressed him in a soft embrace. He suddenly received the flame to which he was accustomed and the well-known heat entered his marrow and raced through his melting bones, not otherwise than when a fiery crack burst from a shimmering lightning bolt and races through the clouds gleaming with light.

d. miraturque interque manus et bracchia uersat terribilem cristis galeam flammasque uomentem,

fatiferumque ensem, loricam ex aere rigentem, sanguineam, ingentem, qualis cum caerula nubes solis inardescit radiis longeque refulget; (*Aen.* 8.619-23)

Aeneas wondered at them and turned them between his hands and arms, the helmet fearful with its crests and shooting forth flames, the deadly sword, and the breastplate stiff with bronze, blood-red, mighty, like when a cloud in the sky begins to glow from the rays of the sun and gleams far off.

e. ipse agmine Pallas
it medio chlamyde et pictis conspectus in armis,
qualis ubi Oceani perfusus Lucifer unda,
quem Venus ante alios astrorum diligit ignis,
extulit os sacrum caelo tenebrasque resoluit.
stant pauidae in muris matres oculisque sequuntur
pulueream nubem et fulgentis aere cateruas. (Aen. 8.587-93)

And Pallas himself goes in the middle of the troop conspicuous for his cloak and figured arms, as when the morning star, whom Venus loves beyond all other fires of the stars, drenched from the wave of the Ocean raises his sacred face to the skies and breaks up the darkness. And the mothers stand fearful on the walls and follow the dust cloud with their eyes and the cavalry gleaming with bronze.

f. cuncta uidens magno curarum fluctuat aestu, atque animum nunc huc celerem nunc diuidit illuc in partisque rapit uarias perque omnia uersat, sicut aquae tremulum labris ubi lumen aënis sole repercussum aut radiantis imagine lunae omnia peruolitat late loca, iamque sub auras erigitur summique ferit laquearia tecti. (Aen. 8.19-25)

Seeing all these things, he floated on a mighty tide of cares and he sent his swift mind now here and now there and snatched it in different directions and turned it through all things, as when from bronze basins the trembling light reflected from the sun or the image of the shining moon flickers around all places and now it reaches up towards the air and strikes the coffers of the highest ceiling.

PART II—Forging Time: From History to Myth

1. illic res Italas Romanorumque triumphos haud uatum ignarus uenturique inscius aeui fecerat ignipotens, illic genus omne futurae stirpis ab Ascanio pugnataque in ordine bella.

(Aen. 8.626-29)

There the fire-ruling god, not ignorant of the prophets nor unknowing of the age to come, had made Italian deeds and the triumphs of the Romans, there the whole race of the future stock of Ascanius and wars fought in order.

2. Talia per clipeum Volcani, dona parentis, miratur rerumque ignarus imagine gaudet attollens umero famamque et fata nepotum.

(Aen. 8.729-31)

He wondered at such things through the shield of Vulcan, the gift of his parent, and though ignorant of the events, he rejoices at the image, lifting on his shoulder the reknown and the destiny of his descendants.

3. Ἡροδότου Θουρίου ἱστορίης ἀπόδεξις ἤδε, ὡς μήτε τὰ γενόμενα ἐξ ἀνθρώπων τῷ χρόνῳ ἐξίτηλα γένηται, μήτε ἔργα μεγάλα τε καὶ θωμαστά, τὰ μὲν Ἑλλησι, τὰ δὲ βαρβάροισι ἀποδεχθέντα, ἀκλέα γένηται, τά τε ἄλλα καὶ δι' ἢν αἰτίην ἐπολέμησαν ἀλλήλοισι. (Herodotus, 1.1)

This is the exposition of the research of Herodotus of Thurii, lest the things done by men should become faded, or the great and wonderful deeds, those performed by the Greeks and the barbarians, should lose their fame, the other deeds and especially for what reason they fought with one another.

4. 'tollite cuncta' inquit 'coeptosque auferte labores, Aetnaei Cyclopes, et huc aduertite mentem: arma acri facienda uiro. nunc uiribus usus, nunc manibus rapidis, omni nunc arte magistra. praecipitate moras.' nec plura effatus, at illi ocius incubuere omnes pariterque laborem sortiti. fluit aes riuis aurique metallum uulnificusque chalybs uasta fornace liquescit. ingentem clipeum informant, unum omnia contra tela Latinorum, septenosque orbibus orbis impediunt. alii uentosis follibus auras accipiunt redduntque, alii stridentia tingunt aera lacu; gemit impositis incudibus antrum; illi inter sese multa ui bracchia tollunt in numerum, uersantque tenaci forcipe massam.

(Aen. 8.439-53)

"Take all else away," Vulcan said and remove the works you have begun, Cyclopes of Aetna, and pay attention to this. Arms must be made for a keen man. Now there is need for strength, now for quick hands, now for all the teaching of your craft. Cast out delays." He spoke no more and they all fell swiftly to work and divided up the task fairly. The bronze flows in streams and the metal of gold and the wound-making steel melts in the huge furnace. They shape the huge shield, one alone against all the weapons of the Latins, and they place layers onto layers sevenfold. Some draw and blow blasts from the windy bellows, others dip the hissing bronze in a basin; the cave roars as the anvils are struck; the Cyclopes lift their arms in turn with great force, in rhythm, and they turn the mass with grasping tongs.

5. a. Ars enim cum a natura profecta sit, nisi natura moveat ac delectet, nihil sane egisse videatur; nihil est autem tam cognatum mentibus nostris quam numeri atque voces; quibus et excitamur et incendimur et lenimur et languescimus et ad hilaritatem et ad tristitiam saepe deducimur; quorum illa summa vis carminibus est aptior et cantibus, non neglecta, ut mihi videtur, a Numa rege doctissimo maioribusque nostris, ut epularum sollemnium fides ac tibiae Saliorumque versus indicant; maxime autem a Graecia vetere celebrata. (Cic. de or., 3.197)

For since art has its origins in nature, it would seem without effect unless nature should move and please; yet nothing is so closely related to our minds as rhythms and sounds, by which we are roused and kindled and lulled and relax and are often influenced to joy and sadness. And the great power of sounds and rhythm is more appropriate to songs and chants, a matter not neglected, I think, by Numa, the most learned king and by our ancestors, as the lyre and pipes of ritual banquets and the verses of the Salii prove, but it was developed especially by ancient Greece.

b. Vestigia autem Pythagoreorum quamquam multa colligi possunt, paucis tamen utemur, quoniam non id agitur hoc tempore. nam cum carminibus soliti illi esse dicantur [et] praecepta quaedam occultius tradere et mentes suas a cogitationum intentione cantu fidibusque ad tranquillitatem traducere, gravissumus auctor in Originibus dixit Cato morem apud maiores hunc epularum fuisse, ut deinceps, qui accubarent, canerent ad tibiam clarorum virorum laudes atque virtutes; ex quo perspicuum est et cantus tum fuisse discriptos vocum sonis et carmina. (Cic. *Tusc.*, 4.3)

Many traces of Pythagoreanism could be collected, but since that is not my purpose now, we will use only a few: the Pythagoreans are said to be accustomed to communicate certain precepts secretly by means of songs and to lead their minds from the mental exertion to calmness by singing and the lyre, and Cato, a most reliable authority has said in his Origines that this was also the custom at banquets in our ancestors' time, namely that the reclining guests would sing in turn the praises and accomplishments of famous men to the accompaniment of the flute, from which source it is clear that both the music and the words were written down then.

c. <sic aderant etiam> in conuiuiis pueri modesti ut cantarent carmina antiqua, in quibus laudes erant maiorum et assa uoce et cum tibicine. (Varro, *Vit.* 84)

So in banquets modest boys were present to sing ancient songs, among which were the praises of the ancestors, both with unaccompanied voice, and to the playing of pipes.

d. Atque utinam exstarent illa carmina, quae multis saeclis ante suam aetatem in epulis esse cantitata a singulis convivis de clarorum virorum laudibus in *Originibus* scriptum reliquit Cato. tamen illius, quem in vatibus et Faunis adnumerat Ennius, bellum Punicum quasi Myronis opus delectat. sit Ennius sane, ut est certe, perfectior: qui si illum, ut simulat, contemneret, non omnia bella

persequens primum illud Punicum acerrimum bellum reliquisset. Sed ipse dicit cur id faciat. 'scripsere' inquit 'alii rem vorsibus'; et luculente quidem scripserunt, etiam si minus quam tu polite. nec vero tibi aliter videri debet, qui a Naevio vel sumpsisti multa, si fateris, vel, si negas, surripuisti. (Cic. *Brutus* 75)

And would those songs survived which Cato in the Origines has recorded used to be sung in banquets many generations before his own time by individual guests about the praises of famous men. Still, the Punic War of Naevius, whom Ennius numbers among the Fauns and shamans, delights us like the work of Myron, even if Ennius is, as he surely is, more finished. And if Ennius himself despised Ennius as he pretends, he would not have omitted the First Punic War from his comprehensive chronicle, since it was very fiercely fought. But he himself tells us the reason why he did that: "Others have written of the event in verses." And they wrote of it brilliantly, even if less sprucely than you did. And you must agree since you borrowed much from Naevius, or, if you deny this, stole them.

6. ... nisi haereret in eorum mentibus mortem non interitum esse omnia tollentem atque delentem, sed quandam quasi migrationem commutationemque vitae, quae in claris viris et feminis dux in caelum soleret esse, in ceteris humi retineretur et permaneret tamen. ex hoc et nostrorum opinione 'Romulus in caelo cum diis agit aevum', ut famae adsentiens dixit Ennius, et apud Graecos indeque perlapsus ad nos et usque ad Oceanum Hercules tantus et tam praesens habetur deus; (Cicero, *Tusc.* 1.27-28)

[they wouldn't have been so concerned with honors for the dead] unless the idea stuck in their minds that death was not a passing away that removes and destroys all but rather a sort of migration and transmutation of life, which in the case of famous men and women is accustomed to lead them into the sky, but in other cases, though it remains on earth, endures nevertheless. And it was according to this belief and the opinion of us Romans that "Romulus passes his life in the sky with the gods," as Ennius says in accord with fama, and among the Greeks, and spreading from them to us and even to the Ocean, Hercules is considered so great and so manifest a god.

7. Musae, quae pedibus magnum pulsatis Olympum... (Ennius, *Ann.* fr. 1)

Muses who beat lofty Olympus with your feet...

Bibliography

Binder, G. (1971) *Aeneas und Augustus: Interpretationen zum 8. Buch der Aeneis.*Meisenheim am Glan.

Cole, S. (2006) "Cicero, Ennius, and the Concept of Apotheosis." *Arethusa* 39: 531-48.

Drew, D. L. (1927) The Allegory of the Aeneid. Oxford.

- Eden, P. T. (1975) A Commentary on Vergil: Aeneid VIII. Leiden.
- Elter, A. (1907) Donarem Pateras: Horat. Carm. 4.8. Bonn.
- Feeney, D. C. (1986) "Following after Hercules in Virgil and Apollonius." PVS 18: 47-85.
- ----(1991) *The Gods in Epic*. Oxford.
- -----(1998) Literature and Religion at Rome: Cultures, Contexts, and Beliefs. Cambridge.
- -----(2007) *Caesar's Calendar: Ancient Time and the Beginnings of History.* Berkeley.
- Feldherr, A. (forthcoming) ""Points of Light: Reflections on Myth and History in the Shield of Aeneas." Forthcoming in M. Fantuzzi and M. Paschalis, eds., *Greek and Roman Ekphrasis* (=*Rethymnon Classical Studies*). Rethymnon.
- Galinsky, G. K. (1966) "The Hercules-Cacus Episode in Aeneid VIII." *AJP* 87: 18-51.
- ----(1972) The Herakles Theme. Oxford.
- Gransden, K. W. (1976) Virgil: Aeneid, Book VIII. Cambridge.
- Habinek, T. N. (2005) *The World of Roman Song: From Ritualized Speech to Social Order*. Baltimore.
- Hardie, P. R. (1986) *Cosmos and Imperium*. Oxford. Heiden, B. (1987) "Laudes Herculeae: Suppressed Savagery in the Hymn to Hercules, Verg. A. 8.285-305." *AJP* 108: 661-71.
- Lowrie, M. (2009) *Writing, Performance, and Authority in Augustan Rome.* Oxford. Mack, S. (1978) *Patterns of Time in Vergil.* Hamden, Conn.
- Momigliano, A. (1984) "The Theological Efforts of the Roman Upper Classes in the First Century B.C." *CP* 79: 199-211.
- Nelis, D. (2001) *Vergil's Aeneid and the Argonautica of Apollonius Rhodius*. Cambridge.
- Newman, J. K. (1967) "Ennius the Mystic III." Greece & Rome 14: 44-51.
- Putnam, M. C. J. (1998) *Virgil's Epic Designs: Ekphrasis in the Aeneid*. New Haven and London.
- Versnel, H. S. (1987) "What did ancient man see when he saw a god? Some reflections on Greco-Roman epiphany", in D. van der Plas (ed.), *Effigies Dei: Essays on the History of Religions*: 42-55. Leiden.
- Veyne, P. (1983) Les Grecs ont-ils cru à leurs mythes? Paris.
- Von Glinski, M. L. (forthcoming, 2012) *Simile and Identity in Ovid's Metamorphoses.* Cambridge.
- Woodman, A. J. (1989) "Virgil the historian", in J. Diggle, J. B. Hall, and H. D. Jocelyn (edd.), *Studies in Latin Literature and its Tradition in Honour of C. O. Brink.* (=*Proceedings of the Cambridge Philological Society*, Supplementary Volume no. 15): 132-45. Cambridge.